CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 24, 2020 VIRTUAL HEARING

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 1:00 PM

Chairperson David McCullough	Present
Vice-Chairperson Tim Hutter	Present
2 nd Vice-Chairperson Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Boardmember Andrew Bowen	Present
Boardmember Diana Cordileone	Present
Boardmember Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember Todd Pitman	Present
Boardmember Cindy Stankowski	Present
Boardmember Mathew Winter	Present
Boardmember Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance Sheila Santos, Board Secretary

Anna McPherson, Program Manager

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner, Board Liaison

Emma Haggerty, Associate Planner Gemma Tierney, Associate Planner

Megan Bacik, Junior Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Lindsey Sebastian, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR August 27, 2020

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR AUGUST 27, 2020 WITH CORRECTIONS.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman Vote: 10-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

GENERAL INFORMATION

- Correspondence from the Public on Item 12
- Correspondence from Save Our Heritage Organisation on Items 5, 6, 8, 9, and 12
- Correspondence from Mission Hills Heritage on Item 5

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 24, 2020 Page 2 of 8

- Updated draft resolutions from Item 5, 10, 11 and 12
- HRB Criteria Guidelines
- Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

None.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Vice-Chair Hutter has a conflict of interest for Item 6 – Gustave and Blanche Ehrenberg Apartments, Item 8 – Frederick Thomas House, and Item 9 – Helen Bradish Spec House #1 and will recuse himself from any discussion and vote.

Boardmember Winter has a conflict of interest for Item 9 – Helen Bradish Spec House #1 and will recuse himself from any discussion and vote.

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Boardmember Pitman disclosed that 10-15 years ago he was invited by the current owners of Item 7 – 6051 Folsom Drive. It was an informal meeting that resulted from his personal interest in the work of Lloyd Ruocco. He was not there professionally in any capacity, and does not feel he has any bias regarding this item. He has not prejudged this and item, and he will base his decision solely on the evidence presented before the Board at today's meeting only.

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None.

C. STAFF REPORT

• HISTORICAL RESOURCES SECTION, DSD

Anna McPherson, Program Manager

The appeal of the reclassification and historic designation of the Gaslamp Quarter Historic District contributor located at 340 5th Avenue, HRB #127-097, is scheduled to be heard by City Council on October 6th.

The 9G site development permit for HRB #1355, the Pacific Telephone and Telegraph Company Garage, was approved by Planning Commission on September 10th.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNING SECTION, PLANNING DEPARTMENT

*Kelley Stanco, Development Project Manager*None.

D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUT

POLICY

Report out by Gemma Tierney

A virtual meeting of the Policy Subcommittee was held on Monday, September 14th. Boardmembers heard a presentation from San Diego History Center staff regarding the proposed relocation of the "Indian" and "Padre" Statues from Presidio Park to the San Diego Historic Center Museum. The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on Monday, Ocotber 12 at 3:00 PM.

ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND TRIBAL CULTURAL RESOURCES

Report out by Gemma Tierney

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee will be held Monday, November 9, 2020 at 4:00pm.

• DESIGN ASSISTANCE

Report out by Suzanne Segur

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Design Assistance Subcommittee will be held Wednesday, October 7, 2020, at 4:00pm.

E. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 6 – the Gustave and Blanche Ehrenberg Apartments is requesting a 30-day continuance to the October agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR MCCULLOUGH TO CONTINUE ITEM 6 – THE GUSTAVE AND BLANCHE EHRENBERG APARTMENTS TO THE OCTOBER AGENDA.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman Vote: 9-0-1 Motion Passes

(Hutter)

The applicant is withdrawing Item 5 – the Fred Bushman Building from today's agenda.

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – ARTHUR AND CATHERINE WELCOME HOUSE *located at 3204 Felton Street* ITEM 11 – CHEROKEE APARTMENTS *located at 3629 Front Street*

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER STANKOWSKI TO APPROVE ITEMS 10 AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Cordileone Vote: 10-0-0 Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 - FRED BUSHMAN BUILDING

Continued from August 2020

Applicant: Massarat Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

<u>Location</u>: 3951 – 3957 Goldfinch Street and 820 W University Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-J**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3951 – 3957 Goldfinch Street and 820 W University Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Fred Bushman Building located at 3951-3957 Goldfinch Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear attached former garage and the single-family house that has the address 820 W. University Avenue.

Report Number: HRB 20-027

THIS ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT.

ITEM 6 – GUSTAVE AND BLANCHE EHRENBERG APARTMENTS Continued from July 2020

Applicant: 6th & Thorn LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 504 - 522 Thorn Street, 92104, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1247 3-F)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 504 – 522 Thorn Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Gustav and Blanche Ehrenberg Apartments located at 516-522 Thorn Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the property located at 504 Thorn Street.

Report Number: HRB 20-028
Staff Report by Emma Haggerty

THIS ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE OCTOBER 29, 2020 AGENDA AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT.

ITEM 7 - MITCHELL AND MARIAN LANGE/LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE

Applicant: Irwin Pfister represented by Scott Moomjian

Owner: Foit/Bobin-Foit Family Trust

Location: 6051 Folsom Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 3-F)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 6051 Folsom Drive Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Mitchell and Marian Lange/Lloyd Ruocco House located at 6051
 Folsom Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1950 under HRB Criteria C and
 D. The designation excludes the attached garage constructed outside the period of significance,

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 24, 2020 Page 5 of 8

and the rear attached former carport, which was enclosed outside of the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 20-052 Staff Report by Gemma Tierney

Testimony Received:

In Favor:

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Cynthia Bobin-Foit, Jennifer Luce

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – MITCHELL AND MARIAN LANGE/LLOYD RUOCCO HOUSE UNDER ANY ADOPTED HRB CRITERIA.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter Vote: 6-4-0 Motion Passes

(Coyle, Pitman, Stankowski, Woods)

ITEM 8 - FREDERICK THOMAS HOUSE

Applicant: 6th & Thorn LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 540 Thorn Street, 92104, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-A)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 540 Thorn Street as a historical resource. <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Frederick Thomas House located at 540 Thorn Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1909 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the enclosed balcony along the south elevation and the northeast two-story addition which were both constructed outside the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 20-044 Staff Report by Emma Haggerty

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Marcela Escobar-Eck, Marie Burke Lia

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER STANKOWSKI TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – FREDERICK THOMAS HOUSE UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 7-2-1 Motion Passes

(Bowen, Pitman) (Hutter)

ITEM 9 - HELEN BRADISH SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Fenton Bankers Hills LLC represented by Nexus Planning & Research

<u>Location</u>: 2004 4th Avenue and 328 Grape Street, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-A**) <u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 2004 4th Avenue and 328 Grape Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Helen Bradish Spec House #1 located at 328 Grape Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1908 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear modified addition constructed outside the period of significance and the building

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 24, 2020 Page 6 of 8

located at 2004 4th Avenue.

Report Number: HRB 20-042 Staff Report by Emma Haggerty

Testimony Received:

In Favor:

In Opposition: Jennifer Ayala, David Gatzke, Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE HELEN BRADISH SPEC HOUSE #1 LOCATED AT 328 GRAPE STREET UNDER CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods Vote: 7-1-2 Motion Passes

(McCullough) (Hutter, Winter)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO DESIGNATE THE FLORENCE HOTEL CARRIAGE HOUSE LOCATED AT 2004 4TH AVENUE UNDER CRITERION A AS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF BANKERS HILL'S HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE BEGINNING IN 1889 WITH ITS EARLY ADAPTIVE RE-USE AS A CARRIAGE HOUSE AND ENDING IN 1921 AS AN APARTMENT BUILDING. SPECIFICALLY, THIS RESOURCE REFLECTS HISTORICAL AND ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT AS THE RARE EVOLUTION OF AN EARLY BANKERS HILL ITALIANATE STYLE HISTORICAL RESOURCE, FROM A CARRIAGE HOUSE SERVING THE FLORENCE HOTEL, TO A SINGLE-FAMILY HOME, AND FINALLY INTO AN APARTMENT BUILDING SERVICE THE 1915 EXPOSITION. RETAINING EXTERIOR HISTORICAL INTEGRITY, THESE CHANGES IN USE SPEAK TO THE UNIQUE HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT AS WELL AS EVOLUTION OF THIS RESOURCE. SIGNIFICANT FOR ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT, THE ITALIANTE STYLE WAS USED BY SAN DIEGO'S FOUNDING FATHERS, SUCH AS ALONZO HORTON, GIVING THIS RARE SAN DIEGO STYLE ADDITIONAL SIGNIFICANCE FOR THE STATURE THESE PIONEERS BROUGHT TO THIS SPECIFIC STYLE AS WELL AS IT'S RARITY DUE TO THE BOOM AND BUST OF THE RAILROAD DURING THE 1880S. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY INFORMATION WITHIN THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, INCLUDING SANBORN MAPS, AS WELL AS WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED PRIOR TO AND AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman Vote: 6-2-2 Motion Passes (Harleman, McCullough) (Hutter, Winter)

ITEM 10 - ARTHUR AND CATHERINE WELCOME HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Sean Ansted and Cherie Carter represented by Johnson and Johnson Architecture <u>Location</u>: 3204 Felton Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3204 Felton Street as a historical resource. <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Arthur and Catherine Welcome House located at 3204 Felton Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the laundry closet addition on the south façade constructed outside the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 20-045

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 24, 2020 Page 7 of 8

ITEM 11 - CHEROKEE APARTMENTS

<u>Applicant</u>: Thomas Utech and Kyle West represented by Urbana Preservation & Planning, LLC <u>Location</u>: 3629 Front Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-A**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3629 Front Street as a historical resource. <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Cherokee Apartments located at 3629 Front Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached four-car garage, which was built outside the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 20-039 ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT.

ITEM 12 - MISSION HILLS BRANCH PUBLIC LIBRARY

Applicant: Mission Hills Heritage represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Owner: City of San Diego

Location: 925 W Washington Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 2 (1268 5-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 925 W Washington as a historical resource. <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Mission Hills Branch Public Library located at 925 W Washington Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1961 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the shed addition on the west façade of the building constructed at an unknown date.

Report Number: HRB 20-047 Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons, Ron May

In Opposition: Sharon Gehl, Clint Daniels, Oscar Tavera

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO DESIGNATE THE MISSION HILLS BRANCH PUBLIC LIBRARY LOCATED AT 925 W WASHINGTON STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1961 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE SHED ADDITION ON THE WEST FAÇADE OF THE BUILDING CONSTRUCTED AT AN UNKNOWN DATE. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS; THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE CONTEMPORARY STYLE WITH FUTURIST MODERN INFLUENCES AND GOOGIE CHARACTERISTICS AND RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE EXHIBITS CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE STYLE, INCLUDING ANGULAR MASSING, UNSWEPT SHED ROOF WITH WIDE OVERHANGING EAVES, STUCCO AND STACKED BRICK CLADDING, AND LARGE ALUMINUM FRAMED WINDOWS AT THE EAST AND NORTH ELEVATIONS.

Seconded by Boardmember Stankowski

Vote: 9-1-0

Motion Passes

(Hutter)

Historical Resources Board Minutes of September 24, 2020 Page 8 of 8

ITEM 13 – APPROVAL OF SPECIAL MEETING AND CANCELLATION OF REGULAR OCTOBER 22, 2020 HRB MEETING

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: City-wide

<u>Description</u>: Consider the cancellation of the standing Historical Resources Board meeting of October 22, 2020, and the scheduling of a special meeting of the Historical Resources Board on October 29, 2020.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Cancel the standing Historical Resources Board meeting of October 22, 2020, or do not cancel; and schedule a special meeting of the Historical Resources Board on October 29, 2020, or do not schedule.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Cancel the standing Historical Resources Board meeting on October 22, 2020 and schedule a special meeting on Thursday, October 29, 2020 at 1:00pm.

Report Number: Memo dated September 15, 2020

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Testimony Received:

In Favor:

In Opposition:

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO CANCEL THE STANDING HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MEETING ON OCTOBER 22, 2020 AND APPROVE A SPECIAL MEETING ON OCTOBER 29, 2020 PER STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman Vote: 10-0-0 Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, October 29, 2020

LOCATION: Virtual Hearing

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:35 PM